

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES

Monday, February 27, 2012 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT

DENISE WOOLERY, VICE-CHAIR - PRESENT BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT @ 3:05 P.M.

BRIAN MILLER - PRESENT FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT JIM ZIMMERMAN - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: ADDISON THOMPSON - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT @ 5:15 P.M.

MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the Meeting Video tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Deisler, Woolery, Bernstein (present @ 3:05 p.m.), Miller, Sweeney, and Zimmerman.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Bedard, Limón (present @ 5:15 p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **February 13, 2012**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of February 13, 2012, as

amended.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **February 21, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise**

Woolery and Glen Deisler.

Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **February 27, 2012**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise**

Woolery and Brian Miller.

Action: Sweeney/Woolery, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Board member **Zimmerman** announced he would be stepping down from **Item #9, 1533 Shoreline Drive**.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

FINAL REVIEW

1. 910 CAMINO VIEJO RD A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-060-046 Application Number: MST2005-00344 Owner: CV Investments, LLC

Architect: Santa Barbara Design & Build

Applicant: Don Gragg

(Proposal to construct a new 3,641 square foot, two-story single-family residence on a 1.3 acre vacant lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal also includes an attached 857 square foot garage and a 400 square foot swimming pool, for a total of 4,498 square feet. The project includes 571 cubic yards of cut and 46 cubic yards of fill under the main building footprint, and 1,071 cubic yards of cut and 1,048 cubic yards of fill outside of the main building footprint. The proposed total of 4,498 square feet is 89% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project includes Planning Commission Review for zoning modifications (Resolution No. 025-06).)

(Final Approval is requested. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to granting Final Approval. Project Design Approval was granted on June 6, 2011.)

(3:07)

Present: Don Gragg and Michelle Lang, Santa Barbara Design & Build.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter from Paula Westbury with expressed concerns was acknowledged.

Motion: Final Approval with the condition that the trash enclosure and details shall be

included on the site plan, at location discussed to observed required setbacks and be

screened from public view.

Action: Miller/Sweeney, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 3439 CAMPANIL DR A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-101-011
Application Number: MST2011-00416
Owner: Klinkon Family Trust
Architect: Dennis Thompson

(Proposal to construct a 310 square foot one-story addition to an existing 5,873 square foot two-story single-family residence located on a 44,431 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The existing residence includes a 1,896 square foot basement, third-story loft, and an attached 582 square foot garage. The project includes a net 99 square foot addition to an existing 415 square foot deck. A 371 square foot accessory structure exists on site and is proposed to remain. The revised proposal results in a total of 6,554 square feet and is 131% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Project Design & Final Approval is requested. Compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on January 3, 2012.)

(3:30)

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect; and Ervin Klinkon, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:34 p.m.

Bob Swanson (Campanil Hill HOA representative) announced his support of the revised project.

A letter from Paula Westbury with expressed concerns was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:35 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with conditions:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's revision of the proposed plans. The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.
- 2) Provide additional details (such as: vertical vent elements above hedge height, and lighting fixtures on north elevation, etc.)
- 3) Provide a landscape plan and compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP).

Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

* THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 5 MINUTES AT 3:45 P.M., AND RECOVENED AT 3:54 P.M. *

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

3. 652 RICARDO AVE E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-025 Application Number: MST2011-00368 Owner: Roy Calvin Petersen

Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Revised Project. Proposal for a remodel and construction of a 402 square foot second-story addition and a 615 square foot one-story addition to an existing 2,027 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, including an attached two-car garage, located on a 20,831 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a new covered porch, and new patios and decks. The proposed total of 3,044 square feet is 65% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications. This project will address the violations listed in ZIR2011-00176.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 005-12. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on November 21, 2011.)

(3:54)

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:01 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, good quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.
- 2) As stipulated by the Staff Hearing Resolution No. 005-12, the Applicant shall "remove any portion of the chain-link fence exceeding 42-inches in height within 10-feet of the front lot line, along La Vista Del Oceano."
- 3) Provide an alternative garage door design to more appropriately match the architectural details of the residence.
- 4) Specify use of two-piece roof tile details on the plans and on the final color and materials board; S-tiles are not acceptable.
- 5) Study reducing the chimney caps and accurately show them on the elevations and plans.
- 6) Provide specifications of the proposed aggregate simulated-stone material.
- 7) Provide wrought iron railing details.

Action: Zimmerman/Bernstein, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 1482 LOU DILLON A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-202-048
Application Number: MST2012-00003
Owner: Terence and Angela Becerra
Architect: Eisenbeiz Design Studio

Landscape Architect: Sam Maphis

(Proposal to construct a new 2,483 square foot, two-story residence with an attached 599 square foot garage on a 2.26-acre lot located in the Hillside Design District. Site improvements include an entry gate, fountain, bio-swale, concrete swale, stone garden walls, flagstone patios, and removal of two Eucalyptus trees, walkways and landscaping. The proposal includes 293 cubic yards of cut and fill grading. The proposal is 54% of the maximum allowed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. The project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 056-03.)

(Third Review. Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 056-03. Compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to granting Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on January 30, 2012.)

(4:22)

Present: John Eisenbeiz, Architect; and Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:40 p.m.

- 1) Kathy Morgan, (downhill neighbor) expressed concerns regarding height, privacy concerns, and use of landscaping to address privacy of downhill neighbors.
- 2) Bruce Bartlett, (downhill neighbor) in support, relayed specific concern for importance of maintaining abundant landscaping to ensure privacy of downhill neighbors (on Scenic Drive).
- 3) Al Fink, (adjacent neighbor on Lou Dillon) in support; more directly impacted visually from proposed project, but support project and efforts to reduce heights.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:51 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the design revisions.
- 2) Study the design of the trellis element on the west elevation.
- 3) Provide updated section details and exterior elevations; include the curb element in section drawings and plans.
- 4) Study methods to enhance the front entry; consider adding some columns.
- 5) Resolve and simplify the details at the garage door.
- 6) Study simplifying the repetitive railing details above the garage.
- 7) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP).

Action: Miller/Woolery, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney/Bernstein opposed).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 909 CALLE CORTITA E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-176-015 Application Number: MST2011-00353

Owner: George and Deanna Gregg Living Trust

(Revised proposal for 999 square feet of one- and two-story additions to an existing 2,080 square foot two-story single-family residence, with an attached 418 square foot two-car garage, located on a 9,727 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The original proposal included a 519 square foot addition at the rear which resulted in an uninhabitable understory area below the addition. This revised proposal now includes the understory as an additional 480 square feet of habitable square footage, thus resulting in the total proposed 999 square feet of one- and two-story additions. A total of 29 cubic yards of grading will be balanced on site. This project will result in a three-story, 3,497 square foot single-family residence, and is 97% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. The project includes Planning Commission review for a requested floor area modification.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review for a floor area modification. The project was last reviewed on February 13, 2012.)

(5:15)

Present: George and Deanna Gregg, Owners.

Public comment opened at 5:25 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission and return to Full Board with the following comments.

- 1) The Board finds the proposed floor-to-lot area modification is aesthetically appropriate and the proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 2) The Board is supportive of design "Option B" and finds the proposed project acceptable and consistent in mass, bulk, and scale, and is appropriate for the neighborhood given the physical conditions and constraints of the parcel, including the site topography; the existing architectural style of the neighborhood; the proposed addition is not visible from the street view; the proposed addition follows the existing contours of the lot and with minimal new ground disturbance; maintaining the view corridor from across and below the site; and maintaining the existing tree canopy and vegetation.
- 3) The Board appreciates the proposed landscaping and compliance methods of the required Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) and looks forward to further refined landscape plan (minimum 18' by 24" sheet size).
- 4) Provide all final approval details and a colors and materials board.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion: To table Item #6, 1431 Shoreline Drive. Action: Deisler/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: To un-table Item #6, 1431 Shoreline Drive. Action: Deisler/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

6. 1431 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-185-010 Application Number: MST2012-00011 Owner: Lauren Emma Trust

Architect: Brian Nelson

(Proposal for alterations and additions to an existing one-story, 2,534 square foot, single-family residence, with an existing detached 620 square foot two-car garage/accessory structure to remain, located on a 15,156 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes demolition and reconstruction of approximately 714 square feet, a new 732 square feet one-story addition, and a new 252 square foot roof terrace. The proposed total of 3,886 square feet is 89% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(7:21)

Present: Brian Nelson, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:30 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's size, bulk, and scale, consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility (with little to no impact), quality of architecture and materials, and landscaping.
- 2) Study the stairwell for additional architectural elements to reinforce or improve the horizontal integrity of the structure or to make more transparent.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 218 SAN CLEMENTE E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-152-018 Application Number: MST2012-00038

Owner: Lennart and Barbara Colombana Trustee

Designer: Carlos Grano

(Proposal for demolition of an existing one-story, 1,013 square foot single-family residence, and construction of a new two-story 1,836 square foot single-family residence and an attached 424 square foot two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,260 square feet, located on a 6,000 square foot lot, is 84% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to granting Final Approval)

(6:18)

Present: Carlos Grano, Designer.

Public comment opened at 6:28 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of support from Anthony Oshehan, and a letter of concern from Paula Westbury were acknowledged.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the size, height, and distance from adjacent neighbors, and consider possible reductions to square footage.
- 2) Study the architectural style and design of the street presence and front entry for a more neighborhood-friendly design.
- 3) Study windows for placement, sizes, and proportions.
- 4) Study the proposed color scheme. It is suggested to reconsider and study an alternative color to the proposed blue color choice. Provide a color and materials board. Consider providing a color rendering.
- 5) Provide a landscape plan and compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP).

Action: Bernstein/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 492 LA CUMBRE RD E-3/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-170-057 Application Number: MST2012-00039

Owner: Hart Family Trust
Applicant: Eric Swenumson
Owner: David Scott

(Proposal to construct a new 1,396 square foot two-story single-family residence and an attached 487 square foot two-car garage located on a vacant 7,501 square foot parcel. The proposed total of 1,883 square feet is 62% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to granting Final Approval)

(6:58)

Present: Eric Swenumson, Applicant; and David Scott, Owner.

Public comment opened at 7:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the driveway approach and front entry walk from La Cumbre Road; provide a larger buffer area and more articulated porch area between the driveway and the front entry door.
- 2) Study providing an entry porch structure.
- 3) Study and simplify the window styles and placement; one consistent window style is preferred; casement windows may be more appropriate.
- 4) Study placements of and incorporating down spouts.
- 5) Provide chimney and fireplace element details.
- 6) Provide a materials board and color board.
- 7) Provide a landscape plan and compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP).

Action: Sweeney/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

E-3/SD-3 Zone

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

9. 1533 SHORELINE DR

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-182-014 Application Number: MST2012-00046

Owner: Anina Davenport Revocable Trust

Architect: James Zimmerman

(Proposal to construct a 1,229 square foot second story addition and a 700 square foot "as-built" bluff-side, circular tiled patio to an existing 2,074 square foot residence with a 345 square foot attached two-car garage located on a 19,166 square foot lot in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and in the Hillside Design District. Project also includes a major façade remodel, a 92 square foot, one-story addition and interior remodel. The proposed total of 3,740 square feet is 85% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit and requested modifications. The proposal will address the violations in ZIR 2011-00381.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit and zoning modifications.)

(7:48)

Present: James Zimmerman, Architect; Anina and Rick Davenport.

Public comment opened at 8:03 p.m.

Michael Baugus, adjacent neighbor, opposition; expressed concerns regarding privacy impacts, private view concerns, and potential traffic impacts.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

A speaker slip of concerns from Barry Nisen was read and acknowledged regarding the second-story addition size, and potential impacts for loss of private views.

Public comment closed at 8:05 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Planning Commission to return to Full Board with positive comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the project's consistency and appearance, neighborhood compatibility, appropriate quality of architecture, design, and materials, and landscaping.
- 2) The Board finds the proposed modification is aesthetically appropriate and it does not pose consistency issues with the Single Family Residence Design Guidelines.
- 3) The Board understands that the gates and pilasters are proposed to be permitted and the circular patio is to be removed.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zimmerman stepped down).

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 1020 PLACIDO AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-008 Application Number: MST2011-00252 Owner: Abigail Solomon-Godeau

Architect: Christine Pierron

Owner: Housing Authority of Santa Barbara

(Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story 2,271 square foot single-family residence to be converted to a congregate care facility. The exterior alterations include a new accessible parking space, accessible ramp, stairs, trash enclosure, deck, and site walls exceeding 3.5 feet in the front yard.)

(Review After Final for alternative materials for deck, stairs, and ramps to be permeable pavers on base with plastered concrete retaining walls.)

Final Approval as submitted of Review After Final.

FINAL REVIEW

B. 2417 MEDCLIFF RD E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-330-014
Application Number: MST2011-00268
Owner: Delson Family Trust

Architect: William Demmary & Associates

Agent: Sid Goldstien
Landscape Architect: Roland Graham

(Proposal for alterations and additions to an existing 2,030 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and a detached 366 square foot garage on a 32,194 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a total of 334 square feet of one-story additions to the residence and alterations and additions to the existing garage to result in a new 487 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,851 square feet is 59% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. The project includes Staff Hearing Officer review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on February 13, 2012. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 03-12.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW

C. 1517 CLIFF DR E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-031-022 Application Number: MST2010-00052

Owner: Mark C. Griffith Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal for a new 750 square foot detached garage with a 500 square foot second-story accessory space above. An existing 350 square foot detached carport would be demolished. The 12,197 square foot lot in the coastal zone is developed with a 1,855 square foot one-story single-family residence. The proposed total of 3,105 square feet is 77% of the maximum floor to lot area ratio. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 023-10.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval was granted on August 2, 2010. Compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) is required.)

Final Approval as submitted.

<u>NEW ITEM – PUBLIC HEARING - NOTICED</u>

D. 872 DEERPATH RD A-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-100-009 Application Number: MST2012-00049 Owner: Knowles Family Trust

Architect: Peter Becker

(Proposal for a 235 square foot, one-story addition and interior remodel to an existing 1,634 square foot, single-story residence, with a 452 square foot attached two-car garage, located on a 27,442 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. A new detached 495 square foot single-story accessory structure, 12 cubic yards of cut and 22 cubic yards of fill grading are also proposed. The proposed total of 2,816 square feet is 59% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code, and continued indefinitely to Consent for Final Approval with the comment to provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

NEW ITEM

E. 1615 SYCAMORE CANYON RD

A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-290-005 Application Number: MST2012-00065

Owner: Kaufman Family Revocable Living Trust

Architect: Roderick Britton Architect

(Proposal to replace all windows with new windows, re-roof, and add a plaster finish over existing wood siding to the exterior of an existing one-story, 1,412 square foot single-family residence located on a 49,646 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the condition to provide compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Brian Miller and Denise Woolery.